Evaluation of Regional Regulations Number 6 of 2003 Concerning the Prohibition of Vagrancy and Begging as Well as the Practice of Prostitutes in the City of Medan

Loice Capri Dewi Sagala* & Indra Muda**

*Public Administration Study Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Medan Area, Indonesia

**Public Administration Study Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Medan Area, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

This study aims to find out how the local government in evaluating begging in Medan City and to find out the inhibiting factors in implementing Medan City Regional Regulation number 6 of 2003 concerning the prohibition of homeless and begging as well as immoral practices in Medan City. This study uses a descriptive method with a qualitative approach through interviews, observations, and documentation. The informants consisted of the head of social rehabilitation, the head of Satpol PP, and several policy targets and the people of Medan City. The results of the study show that the Evaluation of Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2003 in Medan City shows shortcomings in inputs, processes, outputs, and outcomes that hinder the effectiveness of the policy prohibiting vagrants and beggars. Budget limitations, lack of coordination between agencies, and lack of supporting facilities are the main inhibiting factors. Recommendations for improvement include increased fund allocation, strengthening coordination, and more relevant empowerment programs.

KEYWORDS: Evaluation, Begging, Policy

INTRODUCTION

Beggars are a group of people who must receive special attention from the government, especially in the economic, socio-cultural, and health fields (Gunawan et al., 2021; Rumapea, 2017). Beggars are defined as people who earn a daily income by begging in public in various ways and reasons that they use to get mercy from others, beggars can be characterized by a shabby appearance and some have deformed physical conditions, in fact, it is not uncommon for us to find those who take advantage of these physical limitations to get empathy from the people around them, physical limitations such as the visually impaired, deaf and so on (Bangun, 2016; Ningrum & Sumardjoko, 2015; Suharyanto, n.d.).

Beggars themselves are one of the People with Social Welfare Problems (PMKS) which means a person, family or community group who due to an obstacle, difficulty or disorder cannot carry out their social functions, so that their life needs cannot be met, both physically, spiritually and socially

(Rachmawati & Faedlulloh, 2021; Rahmania et al., 2019; Yusuf Hanafi Siregar et al., 2023). The problem of beggars is something that we are used to encountering in big cities, one of which is the city of Medan. The background of the policy of prohibiting beggars is inseparable from historical studies, the Medan City government wants to realize a well-rounded Medan city so that efforts are made to improve the implementation of anti-vagrancy and beggars and moral practices in an integrated manner in Medan City (Effrata & Santoso, 2020; Kesuma, 2014; Siregar et al., 2021). The city of Medan has a very important position, function and role, both as the capital of North Sumatra Province and as a supporter of provincial-scale government activities, including efforts to build a developed urban society and a conducive regional image (Harahap et al., 2022; Lumbantobing et al., 2022; Nasution et al., 2019). The efforts made by the Medan City Government are to issue Medan City Regional Regulation number 6 of 2003 concerning the prohibition of vagrants and begging as well as immoral practices in Medan City. The Regional Regulation was designed and issued considering that the city of Medan is a transit city to several countries and tourism destinations in North Sumatra so that the Medan City government wants to eliminate the impression of slums in the Medan City area (Panjaitan & Lubis, 2022; Rambe et al., 2017; Syaputra, 2017).

An evaluation of the policy prohibiting begging needs to be carried out to find out what are the shortcomings of the implementation of the policy, so that it will make it easier for policy makers to improve or provide appropriate solutions so that the implementation of the policy becomes better. Because as we know since the issuance of Medan City Regulation Number 6 of 2003 until now 2024 the problem of beggars has never been resolved, from year to year we can find an increase in the number of beggars in Medan City.

The Medan City Government may have made various efforts but in reality there are still many obstacles faced in the field, so that the problem of homeless people and beggars in Medan City has never been resolved. The problem of alleviating street children beggars, is mainly caused by the lack of seriousness of policy-making actors to supervise them in accordance with the content of the policy. Both from institutional actors, group actors, and individual actors. Institutional actors who take policies in this field have not fully carried out their functions, such as the Medan City government, the Medan City DPRD, the Medan City Police, the Social Service, and the Pamong Praja Police Unit. A number of parties see that the regional regulation has not been able to solve the Gepeng problem in Medan City, because it does not answer at all the reasons why residents choose to seek livelihoods on the streets (Ilmu Perguruan Perguruan et al., 2020; Mariska et al., 2021; Sirait et al., 2021).

The government should look for the root of the problem of the emergence of beggars, then find a way out. Of course, it is not by forbidding people to become beggars and threatening their donors. Before conducting an evaluation study of the policy of banning beggars in Medan City, the researcher saw that an evaluation was carried out with the aim of improving or to decide the sustainability of a program, so the evaluation must be good and reliable. Therefore, to find out whether the evaluation is good or bad, researchers need a number of criteria or standards as a basis for consideration. According to Stufflebeam & Coryn and The Joint Committee, the standard consists of a utility standard, a feasibility standard, a propriety standard, and an accuracy standard.

This study aims to find out how the local government in evaluating begging in Medan City and to find out the inhibiting factors in implementing Medan City Regional Regulation number 6 of 2003

concerning the prohibition of homelessness and begging as well as immoral practices in Medan City.

RESEARCH METHODS

This study uses a qualitative descriptive method to identify and deeply understand the phenomenon of begging management in Medan City, especially focusing on the obstacles faced and the efforts made by the government in dealing with them. Qualitative research aims to understand the subject's behavior, perceptions, motivations, and actions in a holistic natural context. In this case, the qualitative method allows the researcher to explore the views and experiences of various parties involved in efforts to handle begging.

Data collection techniques include field observations, in-depth interviews with relevant informants, and documentation. Observation directly captures the situation and activities related to the management of beggars, while in-depth interviews with government officials and residents dig up information about the obstacles and handling measures that have been taken. Documentation supports data with archives, photos, and related documents, enriching the understanding of context.

The research data consists of primary and secondary data. Primary data, obtained from interviews and observations, including informants' perceptions and direct experiences related to the management of begging, were used to answer research questions and assess the effectiveness of policies in the field. Secondary data are drawn from literature such as books, journals, scientific articles, and official documents to provide a theoretical foundation and compare the results with previous research.

Researchers use a thematic approach to analyze the data, by identifying patterns and themes from interviews and documentation. The results of this analysis provide a comprehensive overview of the government's obstacles and efforts in dealing with begging in Medan City, as well as comparing existing policies with recommendations from other research or literature. This method is expected to explain the effectiveness of the current begging management policy and provide suggestions for improvement. With a qualitative descriptive approach, this study describes real conditions, the role of the government, and factors that affect the success or failure of policies, as well as provides input for the government to formulate more effective policies.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Evaluation of Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2003 concerning the Prohibition of Homeless and Begging and the Practice of Immorality in the City of Medan

Evaluation of Regional Regulation (Perda) Number 6 of 2003 in Medan City regarding the prohibition of vagrants, beggars, and immoral practices is important to ensure that this policy runs in accordance with its objectives. Good policies are not only measured by direct outcomes or impacts, but also by the implementation process and other components that influence them. Using Nurcholis' evaluation framework that includes Input, Process, Output, and Outcome aspects, this evaluation will help identify the shortcomings of the policy and provide guidance for future improvements.



1. Policy Input

Inputs in policy refer to the various resources that support implementation, including regulations, budgets, workforce, and available infrastructure. Regional Regulation No. 6 of 2003 requires a strong commitment from local governments and the involvement of various institutions, be it from the social service, health office, to the security forces, to implement policies effectively. However, based on the results of the evaluation, it was found that the budget allocation provided was insufficient to support programs aimed at empowering beggars or homeless people who were caught in the net. This lack of funds has an impact on the limited shelter facilities, training programs, and other activities that can help reduce the number of beggars in Medan City more comprehensively. In addition, the number and capacity of the workforce, including officers on duty in the field, have not been optimal, affecting the effectiveness in dealing with this problem.

2. Policy Implementation Process

At the process stage, this policy requires strong coordination between various agencies. The process of policy enforcement of Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2003 includes control measures, the provision of temporary shelters, and coaching programs. However, the evaluation found that there are several obstacles in this stage. One of the main obstacles is the low coordination between related agencies, which causes the handling of homeless people and beggars not to run smoothly. For example, social services responsible for shelter and coaching often do not obtain timely data or information from the agencies that carry out control. As a result, there is a disagreement that can slow down or even hinder the coaching process.

The limitation of shelter facilities is also a significant problem in this process. Existing shelters have not been able to accommodate the growing number of beggars and homeless people, especially in certain seasons where the number of beggars increases. This condition causes many beggars to return to the streets after the lockdown due to the lack of adequate places to house them. In addition, planned coaching and empowerment programs are often ineffective due to limited funds and manpower.

3. Policy Output

The output in the policy evaluation refers to the tangible results produced by this policy, such as the number of controls carried out, training or coaching programs held, and the decrease in the number of beggars. Based on the results of the research, the output of Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2003 shows a decrease in the number of beggars in the short term, especially after intensive control is carried out. However, this decline is only temporary. After some time, the number of beggars increased again due to the lack of sustainability in the coaching programs carried out.

The skills training program held has also not run optimally. Many beggars lack basic skills, so they need comprehensive training so that they can be independent. Unfortunately, the trainings provided are often irrelevant to the needs of the homeless and beggars, which eventually leads them back to the streets. This difficulty shows that the output produced is not in line with the policy goal of eradicating or reducing the number of beggars in Medan City in a sustainable manner.

4. Policy Outcomes

A policy outcome is the long-term impact of policy implementation that includes significant social or economic change. In the case of Regional Regulation No. 6 of 2003, the expected outcome is a permanent decrease in the number of beggars and an increase in social welfare for empowered beggars. However, the results of the evaluation show that the long-term impact of this policy is not significant. Many beggars return to the streets after some time due to a lack of further coaching or appropriate economic opportunities.

One of the factors causing this is the weak understanding of the public and the lack of social campaigns related to the dangers of begging and the importance of social welfare. Without a change in mindset, beggars do not have the motivation to change professions or find other more decent jobs. Therefore, these policy outcomes have not been achieved due to the lack of an approach oriented to fundamental social and economic change.

Based on the evaluation of four policy aspects, namely Input, Process, Output, and Outcome, it is clear that Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2003 in Medan City still faces various obstacles that affect its effectiveness. In terms of input, the allocation of funds and labor is still inadequate. In the implementation process, suboptimal coordination between agencies and the lack of shelter facilities are the main obstacles. The resulting policy outputs only show short-term effects, while the outcomes or long-term impacts of these policies have not met expectations.

To increase the effectiveness of this policy, several recommendations can be put forward. First, local governments need to increase the allocation of funds to expand shelter facilities and provide training programs that are more relevant to the needs of beggars and homeless people. Second, coordination between agencies needs to be strengthened through better communication mechanisms and a clear division of tasks. Third, empowerment programs must be designed more comprehensively by involving the community in social campaigns, so that mindset change can be achieved. Fourth, there needs to be continuous monitoring to ensure that this policy runs in accordance with its goals and produces real outcomes for social welfare.

With these steps, it is hoped that Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2003 in Medan City will not only temporarily reduce the number of beggars, but also provide long-term solutions to improve social welfare and overcome the problem of begging more effectively and sustainably. Policies that are oriented towards economic empowerment, education, and social awareness will be more effective in creating the expected change.

Factors Hindering the Implementation of Medan City Regional Regulations

The Medan City Regional Regulation (Perda) on the prohibition of homelessness, begging, and immoral practices has an important goal to improve social welfare and community security. However, in its implementation, there are various inhibiting factors that result in this policy not running effectively and often not achieving the desired results. This discussion will identify several main factors that hinder the implementation of the Regional Regulation, including budget limitations, lack of coordination between agencies, lack of supporting facilities, and social and cultural challenges.

International Journal of Arts, Humanities and Management Studies

1. Budget Limitations

Budget limitations are one of the main factors that hinder the effectiveness of the implementation of the Medan City Regional Regulation. The budget provided by the government for these programs is often insufficient to meet the needs of comprehensive handling. The lack of funds leads to limited control activities, the provision of shelters, and the implementation of empowerment and training programs for beggars and homeless people. For example, the funds allocated for temporary shelters are often insufficient, so they cannot accommodate all the beggars who are netted. As a result, many of them return to the streets because there are no adequate places. Without a sufficient budget, sustainable coaching programs are difficult to implement, so this policy only has a short-term effect.

2. Lack of Coordination Between Agencies

The implementation of this Regional Regulation involves various government agencies, including the social service, health service, security service, and other related institutions. However, the lack of coordination between these agencies is a serious obstacle in the implementation of the policy. The lack of cooperation and good communication between these agencies often leads to a lack of synchronization of data and information needed for integrated handling. For example, social services responsible for shelter and coaching often do not get information directly from the agencies that carry out control, so the handling process becomes slow and inefficient. As a result, many beggars do not get the services they should receive, and they return to the streets in the absence of effective rehabilitation programs.

3. Lack of Supporting Facilities

The limitations of supporting facilities, especially temporary shelters and coaching facilities, are also the main inhibiting factors. This Regional Regulation requires a shelter that is spacious enough and suitable to accommodate beggars who are caught in the trap of control. However, the existing facilities are often inadequate, both in terms of capacity and quality. Unsuitable shelters will affect the motivation of beggars to take part in coaching programs, so some of them choose to return to the streets. In addition, limited facilities for skills training also hamper empowerment programs that should be an important part of this policy. Without adequate facilities, it is difficult to provide appropriate and beneficial training to beggars so that they can find other jobs and not return to the streets.

4. Low Community Participation

Another factor that hinders the implementation of this Regional Regulation is the low participation and awareness of the public towards the policy of prohibiting begging. Many people still give money or direct assistance to beggars on the streets, without realizing that this action can actually worsen the problem of begging. The attitude of the community that tends to pity beggars and provide assistance without going through the right channels creates an environment that is less supportive of the government's efforts to reduce the number of beggars. The community should be invited to be involved in efforts to empower beggars through official channels, such as donating to institutions that provide rehabilitation and training programs. Public awareness to support this program needs to be increased through appropriate social and educational campaigns.

Social habits and norms in the community are also an inhibiting factor in the implementation of this Regional Regulation. In some circles of society, the practice of begging or begging is still considered a reasonable way to earn a living. Although the government has banned this practice, it is difficult to eradicate it completely due to the view that begging is a legitimate life choice. In addition, many beggars come from other areas and move to Medan City because this city is considered easier to earn income from begging. The culture of society that is tolerant of the existence of beggars needs to be changed with a more persuasive and educational approach, so that this policy can run more effectively.

6. The Inability of Beggars to Access Job Alternatives

Many beggars in Medan City do not have adequate skills or education to find other jobs besides begging. This condition makes it difficult for them to switch to more decent work despite policies that prohibit the practice of begging. Without adequate basic skills, empowerment programs offered by governments are often irrelevant to their needs. This inability causes them to be trapped in a cycle of poverty that is difficult to overcome. To overcome this, the government needs to provide training programs that suit the needs of beggars and provide access to more decent job opportunities.

7. Limitations of Monitoring and Supervision

Weak monitoring and supervision are also an inhibiting factor in the implementation of this Regional Regulation. The local government has limitations in monitoring conditions in the field, especially after the beggars undergo a process of control and coaching. The absence of continuous monitoring leads to many beggars returning to the streets after being fostered because no effort is made to ensure that they actually get the work or other necessary assistance. In addition, the lack of officers responsible for supervision in the field makes it difficult to implement this Regional Regulation consistently and comprehensively.

8. Economic Factors

Poverty and economic limitations are one of the main reasons why many people choose to beg on the streets. The difficult economic situation, especially for those who come from low educational backgrounds and do not have special skills, encourages some people to beg as an easy way to earn money. Without adequate economic support, it is difficult for beggars to switch to other jobs. The government needs to think of long-term solutions that can help beggars to improve their standard of living, such as opening up small business opportunities or providing skills training that suits the needs of the market.

Based on the description above, it can be concluded that the implementation of the Medan City Regional Regulation on the prohibition of vaping, begging, and immoral practices faces various challenges that affect its effectiveness. Budget limitations, lack of coordination between agencies, lack of supporting facilities, low community participation, social and cultural challenges, the inability of beggars to access alternative jobs, limited monitoring and supervision, and economic factors are the main obstacles that must be overcome. To increase the effectiveness of this Regional Regulation, it is necessary to increase the budget, better coordination, provision of adequate supporting facilities, increase public awareness, and empowerment programs that are in accordance

with the needs of beggars. By overcoming these obstacles, it is hoped that this Regional Regulation can run more effectively and have a positive impact on overcoming the problem of begging in the city of Medan.

CONCLUSION

The evaluation of Regional Regulation Number 6 of 2003 in Medan City shows a number of obstacles that hinder the effectiveness of policies in dealing with homeless people, beggars, and immoral practices. In terms of inputs, limited budgets, inadequate shelter facilities, and lack of manpower have a negative impact on policy implementation. The implementation process is hampered by weak coordination between agencies, while the output shows a temporary decrease in the number of beggars, without a sustainable empowerment program. The expected long-term outcomes, namely a permanent reduction in the number of beggars and an increase in their welfare, have not been achieved. This is due to the lack of public awareness and the weak approach to socioeconomic change. To improve these policies, it is necessary to increase the budget for facilities and training, strengthen coordination between agencies, and effective empowerment programs and social campaigns. With these steps, it is hoped that Regional Regulation No. 6 of 2003 can provide a more comprehensive and sustainable solution, not only reducing the number of temporary beggars, but also overcoming the root of social problems in the city of Medan. Policies that focus on economic empowerment and education will create the desired change in the long term.

The implementation of the Medan City Regional Regulation (Perda) on the prohibition of vagrants, begging, and immoral practices faces various challenges that hinder its effectiveness. The main factors that are inhibiting include budget limitations that result in a lack of control activities and empowerment programs, a lack of coordination between agencies that causes insynchronization of data and information, and a lack of adequate supporting facilities for shelters and training. In addition, low community participation, social and cultural challenges, the inability of beggars to access alternative jobs, limited monitoring, and economic factors also exacerbate the situation. To increase the effectiveness of this Regional Regulation, steps such as increasing the budget, improving coordination between agencies, providing better facilities, and social campaigns are needed to increase public awareness. By overcoming these obstacles, it is hoped that this Regional Regulation can have a positive impact on overcoming the problem of begging in the city of Medan.

REFERENCES

- i. Bangun, R. (2016). Kehidupan Anak Pengamen Jalanan Di Simpang Pos Jl. Jamin Ginting Kelurahan Kwala Bekala Medan. UNIMED.
- ii. Effrata, E. A.-A., & Santoso, R. S. (2020). Evaluasi Kebijakan Penanganan Gelandangan (Studi Kasus Peraturan Daerah Kota Semarang No. 5 Tahun 2014 tentang Penanganan Gelandangan, Anak Jalanan, dan Pengemis di Kota Semarang)/57/ADM. PUBLIK/2020. Faculty of Social and Political Science.

International Journal of Arts, Humanities and Management Studies

- iii. Gunawan, R., Siregar, D., & Sulaiman, S. (2021). Pembentukan Dan Pendampingan Wirausaha Pada Kelompok Posyandu Di Desa Sena. Pelita Masyarakat, 3(1), 43–54. https://doi.org/10.31289/pelitamasyarakat.v3i1.5801
- iv. Harahap, A. P. P., Harahap, R. H., & Isnaini, I. (2022). Implementasi Peraturan Menteri Perhubungan Nomor PM 63 Tahun 2019 Tentang Standar Pelayanan Minimum Angkutan Orang Dengan Kereta Api Dalam Kemudahan Dan Kenyamanan Layanan Di Stasiun Kereta Api Medan. Journal of Education, Humaniora and Social Sciences (JEHSS), 5(1), 618–626. https://doi.org/10.34007/jehss.v5i1.1259
- v. Ilmu Pemerintahan, J., Publik, A., & Komunikasi, I. (2020). Pengaruh Komunikasi Interpersonal General Manager Dalam Meningkatkan Motivasi Kerja Karyawan Pada Masa Pandemi The Crew Hotel Medan. Ilmu Komunikasi (JIPIKOM), 4(2), 136–142. https://doi.org/10.31289/jipikom.v4i2.1272
- vi. Kesuma, K. I. (2014). Implementasi Kebijakan Peraturan Daerah Nomor 4 Tahun 2008 Tentang Penanganan Gelandangan Dan Pengemis Di Kota Medan Pada Dinas Kesejahteraan Sosial Provinsi Sumatera Utara. Jurnal Administrasi Publik (Public Administration Journal), 2(1), 71–85. https://doi.org/ttp://dx.doi.org/10.31289/jap.v4i1.1362
- vii. Lumbantobing, S. L., Kusmanto, H., & Ginting, B. (2022). Implementasi Peraturan Menteri Dalam Negeri Nomor 70 Tahun 2019 Tentang Sistem Informasi Pemerintahan Daerah pada Penerapan E-Planning dalam Perencanaan Pembangunan di Kabupaten Pakpak Bharat. Perspektif, 11(4), 1546–1558. https://doi.org/10.31289/perspektif.v11i4.7227
- viii. Mariska, R., Kusmanto, H., & Fadli, F. (2021). Analisis Distribusi Logistik pada Pemilu 2019 di Kota Medan. Perspektif, 10(1), 110–119. https://doi.org/10.31289/perspektif.v10i1.4143
- ix. Nasution, F. A., Studi, P., Ilmu, M., Ilmu, F., Politik, I., & Diponegoro, U. (2019). Partisipasi Politik Masyarakat Kecamatan Medan Maimun pada Pemilihan Gubernur Sumatera Utara Tahun 2018 Political Participation Medan Maimun District Community at Election Governor North Sumatra Year 2018. 7(2), 227–235.
- x. Ningrum, A. O. C., & Sumardjoko, B. (2015). Analisis Pengamen Jalanan Di Kota Surakarta (Studi kasus Pengamen Jalanan di Kota Surakarta). Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta.
- xi. Panjaitan, J., & Lubis, Y. A. (2022). Implementasi Peraturan Daerah Kota Medan No 6 Tahun 2003 Tentang Larangan Gelandangan Dan Pengemisan Serta Praktek Susila Dikota Medan Dalam Pencegahan Dan Penanggulangan Pekerja Seks Komersial (PS. 4(6), 1–8. https://doi.org/10.31289/strukturasi.v4i1.1178
- xii. Rachmawati, V., & Faedlulloh, D. (2021). Dinamika Pelaksanaan Kebijakan Program Pelayanan Penyandang Masalah Kesejahteraan Sosial Anak Jalanan. Journal of Political Issues, 2(2), 67–78. https://doi.org/10.33019/jpi.v2i2.38
- xiii. Rahmania, R., Munir, A., & Budiman, Z. (2019). Hubungan Lokus Kendali Internal dan Dukungan Sosial Dengan Kesejahteraan Psikologis pada Penyandang Disabilitas di Aceh Tengah. Tabularasa: Jurnal Ilmiah Magister Psikologi, 1(1), 49–58. https://doi.org/10.31289/tabularasa.v1i1.275



International Journal of Arts, Humanities and Management Studies

- xiv. Rambe, K. M., Area, U. M., Faridhi, A., Hasibuan, L. R., SH., MH, M., & Syaputra, M. Y. A. (2017). Putusan Verstek dalam Hukum Acara Perdata. Jurnal Mercatoria, 10(2), 109. https://doi.org/10.31289/mercatoria.v10i2.1202
- xv. Rumapea, M. E. (2017). Pendidikan Komersial Dan Gaya Hidup. JPPUMA: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan Dan Sosial Politik UMA (Journal of Governance and Political Social UMA), 5(2), 139. https://doi.org/10.31289/jppuma.v5i2.1209
- xvi. Sirait, Y. K., Kadir, A., & Mashito, B. (2021). Efektivitas Rekrutmen Pegawai Di Spbu Coco Pertamina Retail Medan. Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan, Administrasi Publik, Ilmu Komunikasi (JIPIKOM), 3(1), 53–58. https://doi.org/10.31289/jipikom.v3i1.515
- xvii. Siregar, S. A., Kadir, A., & ... (2021). Implementasi Peraturan Daerah Kota Medan Nomor 6 Tahun 2003 Tentang Gelandangan dan Pengemisan Serta Praktek Tuna Susila. ..., Administrasi Publik ..., 3(1), 47–52. https://doi.org/10.31289/jipikom.v3i1.483
- xviii. Suharyanto, A. (n.d.). Punk: Pengamen Jalanan dan Sebuah Subkultur Dari Kehidupan Urban di Kota Medan. Anthropos: Jurnal Antropologi Sosial Dan Budaya (Journal of Social and Cultural Anthropology), 7(1), 98–105.
- xix. Syaputra, M. Y. A. (2017). Kajian Hukum Pemberlakuan Perda Kota Medan Nomor 6 Tahun 2003 Perspektif Utilities Theory. Jurnal Mercatoria, 10(2), 197. https://doi.org/10.31289/mercatoria.v10i2.1205
- xx. Yusuf Hanafi Siregar, Sismudjito, S., & Ginting, B. (2023). Peran Pemerintah Kota Medan dalam Menjamin Kesejahteraan Penyandang Disabilitas. Perspektif, 12(1), 185–195. https://doi.org/10.31289/perspektif.v12i1.8465